

# INTEGRATIVE VERSUS INSTRUMENTAL MOTIVATION AMONG FOREIGN LANGUAGE ONLINE LEARNERS

Biljana Ivanova, Dragana Kuzmanovska, Ana Vitanova-Ringaceva, Darinka Marolova

*Faculty of Philology, University Goce Delcev (MACEDONIA)*

## Abstract

One of the most important individual differences shaping language learning outcomes is learner motivation. Given the considerable amount of time and effort needed to achieve advanced language proficiency in a foreign language, learners who are strongly motivated are much more likely to succeed. For these reasons, the issue of motivation plays a key role in all facets and types of learning. But it's perhaps most important in language learning, where progress can be difficult to see on a day-to-day basis. Learners with a positive attitude to their course and their studies are more likely to continue working hard and to keep going when times are tough. Although not everyone who is motivated to learn does eventually achieve their goal, many learners who do are frequently highly motivated individuals. Maintaining high levels of student motivation is vital for language educators. A number of studies have been carried out on the relationship of online learning to motivation in classroom settings. This study investigates the integrative and instrumental motivation of Turkish students who study Macedonian, English and German online at the Institute of Languages – Goce Delcev, University, Stip, Republic of North Macedonia. The study was conducted with 300 students attending an online foreign language course as part of their preparatory course and examines the impact of online individual and collaborative activities on their foreign language motivation. The results suggest that instrumental and integrative motivation for the Turkish students who study Macedonian, English and German language varies by age, gender, income, education, linguistic background, and target language. By identifying noticeable affective and cognitive factors affecting intermediate and predominantly advanced students' decisions to speak English, German and Macedonian, this research could present additional insight into current research. Ultimately, with this research, teachers, professors, educational professionals, and others intrigued in learning about factors affecting foreign/second language learners' decisions to speak, may find this useful within the worldwide landscape of second language learning and teaching. Motivations for this research have also resulted from our personal experiences in speaking another language. We were curious about why certain decisions were made to resist speaking English, German and Macedonian even when students chose to live in a foreign country and attended a language institute to become proficient in a foreign/second language. This study confirms that the distinctions between instrumental and integrative motivation are meaningful in online language learning and applicable to other cultural contexts as well.

Keywords: integrative and instrumental motivation, foreign language learning, online learning.

## 1 INTRODUCTION

Teaching ESL is a very complex process because of a number of variables involved with the teacher assuming multiple roles. Language teachers, including the authors of this paper, have observed on many occasions apprehension and discomfort experienced by many students who attempted to acquire and produce a foreign language. As educators we need to find different approaches and try to use different materials in the teaching process. These new types of knowledge will empower students to gain adequate language proficiency needed for the challenges and demands of the 21st century. The teacher's main role is to find and create powerful learning environments that allow this to happen. This would ensure that the learners' self-concept is congruous to the learning process and that their self-esteem and self-confidence while learning ESL are promoted as well as protected, which means that motivation is therefore instrumental to achieving this.

The primary purpose of this paper is to examine the motivational patterns of Turkish learners of English and Macedonian and individual and social variables in learning English and Macedonian as a foreign language online. Why do Turkish learners feel anxious while studying English, German and Macedonian and what are the factors or sources that make speaking English and Macedonian more stressful in some situations than in others?

The main aim of this study is to find out and suggest some strategies for alleviating language motivation. This investigation will hopefully give us the answers concerning the level of motivation of students who learn English, German and Macedonian as a foreign language online and will possibly provide additional insight into a better identification of the existing motivational challenges and into taking a more realistic perspective of English and Macedonian Language Teaching in the country.

We, as foreign language teachers seek to understand what factors influence learners' decisions to speak. What effects do factors such as language motivation have on ESL students' decisions to speak in the classroom? Taking risks in speaking English, German and Macedonian by the Turkish students is a fascinating area for discovery, especially when considering beliefs affecting those decisions. Why are some students of the same linguistic background willing to take risks in speaking and have seemingly minimal fear when doing so? Does the willingness to take risks affect those decisions? Do people or factors affect those decisions to speak? At the conclusion of this research, our intentions are to describe factors that may affect students' willingness to speak foreign language in the classroom.

Hopefully, this research can further the discussion and assist in inspiring foreign language learners' quest to ultimately become fully proficient speakers. By identifying noticeable affective and cognitive factors affecting intermediate and predominantly advanced students' decisions to speak English, German and Macedonian this research could present additional insight into current research. Ultimately, with this research, teachers, professors, educational professionals, and others intrigued in learning about factors affecting foreign language learners' decisions to speak, may find this useful within the worldwide landscape of foreign language learning and teaching.

The foreign language learner has unique factors to consider while learning the language online. We have noticed that some foreign language students are more reluctant to speak online than others and we are aware of the silence a foreign language learner projects in mainstream classes. Nervousness, refusal to participate, and limited risk taking in speech are some of the observations we have made. When we compare talking in mainstream to an ESL classroom one advanced English learner said she does not talk in the mainstream classroom. Perhaps a pull-out online classroom provides a comfort level to non-native speakers that they cannot find in a mainstream classroom. Learning about students who are challenged by these factors and how they respond positively and/or negatively in the online classroom may shed light on foreign language pedagogy. Furthering the study of factors affecting students' decision to speak could suggest current implications to possibly assist teachers of these and other students.

Motivations for this research have also resulted from our personal experiences in speaking another language. We were curious about why certain decisions were made to resist speaking English, German and Macedonian even when students chose to live in a foreign country and attended a language institute to become proficient in a foreign language. Our teaching career has included both special education and general education within the several years in the online classroom. The environments in which we have taught have included being a university teacher and teaching foreign language at the elementary level, i.e. teaching newcomers and advanced language learners. Our most recent three years have included foreign language instruction of predominantly beginner, elementary and pre-intermediate level of foreign language learning students who are preparing to enroll a foreign language university. Hence, our interest and experience in foreign language online teaching includes both varying ages and developmental stages in learning. Even though this research will concentrate on students who are preparing to enroll a foreign university, our overall experience with language learning includes a broad range of learners.

First, students' actual global level is beginner or elementary. This may be because they register on the courses after several years without any contact with English, German and Macedonian before. Or it may be due to the unfamiliar topics and vocabulary, the authentic and semi-authentic material, and the tasks in English, German and Macedonian which often simulate real life situations related to their particular specialist area.

Second, although in these courses a four-skill approach is used (taking in listening, speaking, reading, and writing), oral skill is emphasized both in class and on the exam.

Third, as our students study English, German and Macedonian to enroll a foreign university, they may perceive that especially speaking English, German and Macedonian, is of crucial importance for their success in finding a job and achieving promotion in their professional careers.

We believe that with the results obtained from the study made among the students learning English, German and Macedonian as a foreign language, the justification of this paper will be shown, and it will

be able to find its way as a part of English, German and Macedonian study, and the most important, it will help students surpass the obstacles while studying these languages.

## **2 METHODOLOGY**

Dornyei proposed a motivational framework consisting of four subsystems: integrative motivation, instrumental motivation, the need for achievement, and attrition about past failures. Another division of motivation is dividing it into intrinsic and extrinsic motivation. Intrinsically motivated behaviors are internal rewards (for example “the joy of doing a particular activity or satisfying one’s curiosity”) (Dornyei 1994, p.275) while extrinsically motivated behaviors are those that the individual performs to “receive some extrinsic award”, for example good grades, or to avoid punishment. This model was upheld by Clement and Kruidenier (1983) and Noels et al. (2000) who extended Dornyei’s framework by adding “amotivation” to it and dividing intrinsic motivation into knowledge, mastery and stimulation, and extrinsic motivation into external, interjected and identified regulation. On the other hand, Manolopoulou- Sergi (2004) suggests that motivation can be related to different stages of information processing: input, central processing, and output. However, the applicability of these frameworks needs to be verified by extensive empirical evidence.

Although both instrumental and integrative motivations have been established as important predictors of language learning, previous work has provided different findings as to the question which of two types of motivation is more essential. Gardner and his Canadian colleagues conducted a research on French learning in Canada which indicated that both monetary rewards and integrative desires were positively related to various aspects of second language learning, such as length of learning, effectiveness of learning, behaviors in the classroom, and willingness to interact with members of that community (Gardner and McIntyre, 1991; Gardner et al., 1992). On the other hand, Clement and Kruidenier (1983), who based their study on learners from unicultural and multicultural backgrounds, argue that “the integrative orientation appeared only in multicultural contexts among members of a clearly dominant group” (p.72). Dornyei (1994) is the one who contributed to the discussion by drawing our attention to social milieus. He pays a lot of attention to the difference between second language acquisition and foreign language acquisition, pointing out that Gardner and his colleagues conducted their research mainly in SLA contexts characterized by direct exposure or frequent interaction with the target language community, while FLA contexts involve the target language being taught in school as an academic subject and “a great proportion of the variance in language attainment” (p. 49). When talking about FLA settings, Dornyei claims that although integrative motivation affects language learning to some extent, instrumental motivation may be particularly important. The existing evidence points to the fact that contexts have a profound impact on the instrumental and integrative motivations related to language learning. “The nature and effect of certain motivation components might vary as a function of the environment in which the learning takes place” (Dornyei, 1990, p. 48). While over-viewing his theory Gardner also admitted that the role of motivation should be consistent and universal in language learning in different settings. He and McIntyre (1991) later emphasized that “the important point is that motivation itself is dynamic” (p. 62). Therefore, the inclusion of contexts as a variable is essential to our understanding of motivation in relation to language learning. Research Methodology consists of research approach, research type, tools, and subjects. The present research paper followed only qualitative approaches. The research type is exploratory research.

### **2.1 Research questions**

The present study examined the motivational patterns of Turkish students who study English, German and Macedonian online. More specifically, the study seeks to answer the following questions:

- 1 What are the motivational patterns of Turkish students to study English, German and Macedonian?
- 2 Which motivation is stronger, integrative or instrumental?

The study is based on a survey consisting of a motivational questionnaire and a background questionnaire which were made among the Turkish students who study English, German and Macedonian as preparatory courses to enroll a foreign university.

### **2.2 Participants**

The survey was made on Turkish students who study Macedonian, English and German as a foreign language online at the Institute of Languages – Goce Delcev, University, Stip, the Republic of North Macedonia. Their age ranges from 18-29, the average age is 20 and male and female participants in

percentage is 54% males and 46% females. The participants have already taken one course of Macedonian and English classes at the Institute of Languages but the level and area of the language they study is different according to the content of the subject and their knowledge of the language they study. Two instruments were used for this study: a motivational questionnaire, and a background questionnaire. The students were interviewed at the end of the fall semester.

### 2.3 Instruments and Procedure

Two instruments were used in the study: a background questionnaire (Table 1), and a modified motivational questionnaire. An electronic version of the instruments was printed and administered to the Turkish students. According to the written instruction, the students were orally informed that their participation is voluntary and that they should provide their own answers and opinions as honestly as they could in order to receive a real picture about their motivation level while studying English, German and Macedonian. Students were given 10 minutes for each questionnaire to fill and produce frank answers, which was crucial for the investigation.

*Table 1. Student Background Questionnaire*

<p>This questionnaire aims to help you understand your English learning background, and, in that way help you to learn even better. It can also help you and your teacher to plan your course in English. Please fill it and circle where necessary.</p>	
Name: _____	Date: _____
Age _____	
Gender _____	
I have studied English for _____ year(s) in _____	
(country/countries).	
My mother tongue* is	
_____	
Apart from English, German and Macedonian I have also studied/I also speak (some)	
_____	
_____	
Importance of English, German and Macedonian in Turkey	
_____	
_____	

The background questionnaire consists of questions about students' age, gender, years of studying English, German and Macedonian, field of study and the importance of English, German and Macedonian in their country. There was a focus group of 300 Turkish students who study Macedonian, English and German as a foreign language online at the Institute of Languages – Goce Delcev, University, Stip, the Republic of North Macedonia. Their age ranges from 18-29, the average age is 20 and male and female participants in percentage are 54% males and 46% females. The average years of learning English is 9 German ranges from 3- 5 and Macedonian 0. Most of them answer the question about the importance of English, German and Macedonian in their country as an opportunity to study in a foreign country.

The motivational questionnaire was carefully adapted from the motivation surveys administered in foreign language settings by Clément and Kruidenier (1983), Clément et al. (1994) and Ely (1986) in such a way that the items were deemed concise, explicit and characteristic of the Macedonian settings. The questionnaire was modified into 16 questions and the students again answered from "strongly agree" to "strongly disagree". Items 3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 9, 11, 12 were adapted from Ely (1986), with "Spanish" replaced by "English, German and Macedonian". Items 1, 2, 5, 7, 10, 16 were adapted from Clément and Kruidenier (1983), with "French" changed into "English, German and Macedonian". Items 13, 14, 15 were adopted from Clément, Dörnyei, and Noels (1994). The respondents were asked to rate each of the 16 statements about the reasons for English, German and Macedonian learning on the same 5-point interval scale as used for the FLCAS in terms of their agreement with the statement in descending order.

The data analysis was done in correlation to the questionnaires and students' answers. Students' answers were given in percentages and represented to the students so they could see their overall motivation while learning English, German and Macedonian. The percentages for each question are given in the same questionnaire and they give the current situation of the students' motivation while learning English, German and Macedonian as a foreign language. Some answers might surprise some of the readers of this paper. The students gave their answers as honestly as they could so the results are true and honest and because of that the improvement which will hopefully come later during their study of English, German and Macedonian will become the best result ever. While analyzing the results, we will try to find the answers to the questions why students behave like that and we will also try to help them to raise the level of motivation through seeing the studying of English, German and Macedonian language as a natural and interesting thing, which will be of enormous help in their later work.

## 2.4 Results

In order to see the difference between the instrumental and integrative motivational items and which have more influence on people's motivation separate tables were made for both motivations. The tables below present the percentages of students' answer according to instrumental (Table 2) and integrative (Table 3) level.

*Table 2. Instrumental motivation items*

I want to be able to use it with English, German and Macedonian speaking people.	87%
It will be helpful for my future career.	100%
I may need it to be admitted to a higher school.	100%
I need it to fulfil the university foreign language requirement.	72%
It may make me a more qualified job candidate.	92%
I have to take the Final Language Exam.	44%
I want to understand English/German/Macedonian films/videos, pop music, or books/magazines.	50%

87% of the students strongly agree and agree with the statement that they need English language because they want to use it in an English/German/Macedonian speaking area. 100% of them, which is of course the highest percentage, answered that English, German and Macedonian would be helpful in their future career. 100% of the students strongly agree and agree with the statement that they need to know English, German and Macedonian because they might use it in higher education. 72% of them think that they need the language so that they can fulfil the university foreign language requirement. 92% of the students strongly agree and agree with the fact that knowing English, German and Macedonian language will make them more qualified candidates. 44 % of them agree with the statement

that they need to learn English, German and Macedonian because they will have to take the Final Language Exam. And, according to the last instrumental item, 50% of the students strongly agree and agree with the statement that they need to understand English, German and Macedonian language because they want to understand English, German and Macedonian films/videos, pop music, or books and magazines.

*Table 3. Integrative motivation items*

I would like to travel to an English/ German/Macedonian speaking area.	84%
I am interested in Macedonian/English/ German culture, history, and literature.	56%
It helps me understand Macedonian/English/ German speaking people and their way of life.	90%
I need it for study abroad.	100%
I can get pleasure from learning Macedonian/English/ German.	70%

According to the integrative motivation items, 84% of the students strongly agree and agree with the fact that they need English, German and Macedonian language because they want to travel to an English/German and Macedonian speaking area. 56% of them strongly agree and agree with the statement that they are interested in English/German/Macedonian culture, history, or literature. 90% of the students answered that they need English/German/Macedonian language because it will help them understand English/German/Macedonian-speaking people and their way of life. 76% of the students strongly agree and agree with the statement that they need English, German and Macedonian to study abroad. And the last integrative statement in the questionnaire was answered positively by 70% of the students. Looking at the results of the instrumental and integrative motivation items of the motivation questionnaire, it is more than obvious that the students' motivation level is lower with the integrative items, but at the same time they feel 100 % motivated when they answer the statements concerning their future career and language which makes them more qualified job candidates and the need to study abroad and the pleasure from learning the language. Eventually, both integrative and instrumental orientations, and intrinsic and extrinsic motivations contribute to the learning of a foreign language. Nevertheless, the answer to the question which one is more important varies from context to context. Likewise, students in different contexts may be motivated to learn foreign language by different orientations. This is why the issue is still worth further exploration in situations with different groups of learners. If we closely examine the motivation questionnaire given to the students, we can notice that there is a dichotomy: integrative vs. internal motivation which was consistent in the motivation cluster found by Ely (1986). For example, although "I want to understand English/German/Macedonian films/videos, pop music, or books/magazines" appeared integrative, it was more instrumental by nature, as suggested by the factor analysis. It is likely that students want to improve their English, German and Macedonian for entertainment, not for integrative purposes. On the other hand, as a reason for studying English/German/Macedonian the question "I need it for study abroad" was integrative, rather than instrumental, which can indicate a studying abroad with desire to get involved in the target culture. This leads to the conclusion that there is no way to categorize instrumental and integrative motivation. However, instrumental motivation appeared to be more prominent than the integrative one. Our learners are more concerned about the role English/German/Macedonian language plays in their academic and career advancement. 100% think that English/German/Macedonian language will help them in their future careers. Fourteen questions of this questionnaire were supported by the students. Question 11 is the only question that is below 50% but, even there one third of the students answered positively. The two types of motivation (instrumental and integrative) are different to the extent that they affect the anxiety level. Integrative motivation, not the instrumental one, seems to be able to predict the anxiety level of learners to some extent. This is consistent with Noels et al. (1999) who suggest: Learning a language for material rewards or because of some pressure does not support sustained effort or eventual competence. Language learners who have valued goals for learning, particularly the goal of self-development and enjoyment in learning, tend to be more involved and successful in that learning experience.

### **3 CONCLUSION**

This study aimed at understanding the extent to which motivation affects English, German and Macedonian learning at Macedonian institutions of higher learning. In conclusion, the results indicated a moderately high motivation level. The two tables presenting the results of the integrative and instrumental motivation show that students' anxiety level is greater with the integrative items because the motivation is

lower. The results of this study suggest that learners' motivation and identities are rooted in their historical background and influenced by both social and contextual factors. The findings support other researchers' views (e.g., Norton, 2000; Thorne, 2005) that motivation is not a static element, but is shaped by previous and ongoing activities and changes corresponding to the broader social context. The students demonstrated two prominent factors on the motivation scale: instrumentality and integrativeness and validated the context-specific approach to the understanding of this model. It seems that, in the foreign language learning process, the more learners engage in learning activities, the more actively they locate themselves in the social context and make efforts to align with social discourses, and the more they experience.

## REFERENCES

- [1] Clément, R., Dörnyei, Z., & Noels, K. A. (1994). Motivation, self-confidence, and
- [2] group cohesion in the foreign language. *Language Learning*, 44(3), 417 - 448.
- [3] Clément, R., & Kruidenier, B.G. (1983). Orientations in second language acquisition: The effects of ethnicity, milieu and target language on their emergence. *Language Learning*, 33, 273-291.
- [4] Csizer, K., & Dörnyei, Z. (2005). The internal structure of language learning motivation and its relationship with language choice and learning effort. *The Modern Language Journal*, 89(1), 19-36.
- [5] Dörnyei, Z. (1994). Motivation and motivating in the foreign language classroom. *Modern Language Journal*, 78, 273-284.
- [6] Dörnyei, Z. (2001). *Teaching and researching motivation*. Longman: Pearson Education Limited.
- [7] Ely, C. (1986). Language learning motivation: A descriptive and causal analysis. *The Modern Language Journal*, 70(1), 28-35.
- [8] Gardner, R. C. (1982). Language attitudes and language learning. In E. B. Ryan, and H. Giles (Eds.), *Attitudes towards language variation* (pp. 132-147). London, United Kingdom: Edward Arnold.
- [9] Gardner, R. C. (1985). *Social psychology and second language learning*. Edward Arnold.
- [10] Gardner, R. C., Lalonde, R. N., and Moorcroft, R. (1985). The role of attitudes and motivation in second language learning: Correlational and experimental considerations. *Language Learning*, 35, 207-227.
- [11] Gardner, R. C., Lalonde, R. N., Moorcroft, R., and Evers, F. T. (1987). Second language attrition: The role of motivation and use. *Journal of Language and Social Psychology*, 6, 29-47.
- [12] Gardner, R. C. and MacIntyre, P. D. (1991). An instrumental motivation in language study. *Studies in Second Language Acquisition*, 13, 57-72.
- [13] Kirova, Snezana and Petkovska, Biljana and Kuzmanovska, Dragana (2012) Investigation of motivation and anxiety in Macedonia while learning English as a second/foreign language. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 46. pp. 3477-3481.
- [14] Lamb, M. (2004). Integrative motivation in a globalizing world. *System*, 32, 3-19.